



## Measure and Integration Exercises 11

1. Let  $(E, \mathcal{B}, \mu)$  be a measure space, and  $f_n : E \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  a sequence of measurable real valued functions on  $(E, \mathcal{B}, \mu)$ .

(a) Suppose  $f : E \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is measurable. Show that

$$\{x \in E : \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) \neq f(x)\} = \bigcup_{l=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l\}.$$

(b) Show that if  $f_n \rightarrow f$   $\mu$  a.e., then for every  $\epsilon > 0$

$$\mu\left(\bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq \epsilon\}\right) = 0.$$

**Proof (a)** Let  $B = \{x \in E : \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) \neq f(x)\}$  and suppose  $x \in B$ . Then, there exists  $\epsilon > 0$  such that for every  $m \geq 1$ , there exists an  $n \geq m$  such that  $|f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq \epsilon$ . This implies that for each  $m \geq 1$ , one has  $\sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq \epsilon$ . Furthermore, there exists  $l \geq 1$  such that  $1/l < \epsilon$ , then for each  $m \geq 1$ ,  $\sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq \epsilon > 1/l$ . Thus,

$$x \in \bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l\} \subseteq \bigcup_{l=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l\}.$$

Conversely, let  $x \in \bigcup_{l=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l\}$ , then there exists  $l \geq 1$  so that for all  $m \geq 1$ ,  $\sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l$ . Then for any  $0 < \epsilon < 1/l$ , one has  $\sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| > \epsilon$ . In other words, for each  $m \geq 1$  there exists  $n \geq m$  such that  $|f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq \epsilon$ . Hence,  $x \in B$ .

**Proof (b)** If  $f_n \rightarrow f$   $\mu$  a.e, then  $\mu(B) = 0$ . Hence, by part (a) one has  $\mu\left(\bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l\}\right) = 0$  for each  $l \geq 1$ . But for any  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists an  $l \geq 1$  such that  $1/l < \epsilon$ , then

$$\mu\left(\bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq \epsilon\}\right) \leq \mu\left(\bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \{x \in E : \sup_{n \geq m} |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/l\}\right) = 0$$

2. Consider the measure space  $([0, 1], \mathcal{B}_{[0,1]}, \lambda_{[0,1]})$ , where  $\mathcal{B}_{[0,1]}$  and  $\lambda_{[0,1]}$  are the restrictions of the Borel  $\sigma$ -algebra and Lebesgue measure on  $[0, 1]$ . Define a sequence of measurable functions  $f_n$  on  $[0, 1]$  as follows: given  $n \geq 1$ , there exist an  $m \geq 0$  and  $0 \leq l \leq 2^m - 1$  such that  $n = 2^m + l$  (note that this representation is unique). Set  $f_n = f_{2^m+l} = 1_{[l/2^m, (l+1)/2^m)}$ .

- (a) Determine explicitly  $f_1, f_2, f_3, f_4, f_5, f_6, f_7$ .  
 (b) Show that  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) = 1$  for all  $x \in [0, 1]$ .  
 (c) Show that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|f_n\|_{L^1(\lambda_{[0,1]})} = 0$ . Conclude that  $L^1$ -convergence does not imply  $\mu$  a.e. convergence.

**Proof (a)** Notice that  $1 = 2^0 + 0$ ,  $2 = 2^1 + 0$ ,  $3 = 2^1 + 1$ ,  $4 = 2^2 + 0$ ,  $5 = 2^2 + 1$ ,  $6 = 2^2 + 2$ ,  $7 = 2^2 + 3$ . Thus,  $f_1 = 1_{[0,1]}$ ,  $f_2 = 1_{[0,1/2)}$ ,  $f_3 = 1_{[1/2,1]}$ ,  $f_4 = 1_{[0,1/4)}$ ,  $f_5 = 1_{[1/4,2/4)}$ ,  $f_6 = 1_{[2/4,3/4)}$ ,  $f_7 = 1_{[3/4,1]}$ .

**Proof (b)** Notice that for each  $m \geq 1$ ,  $\{[l/2^m, (l+1)/2^m) : 0 \leq l \leq 2^m - 1\}$  forms a partition of  $[0, 1]$ . Hence, for each  $x \in [0, 1]$  and for every  $m \geq 0$  there exists an  $0 \leq l \leq 2^m - 1$  such that  $f_{2^m+l}(x) = 1$ . Thus  $f_n(x) = 1$  for infinitely many  $n$ . This shows that  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) = 1$  for all  $x \in [0, 1]$ .

**Proof (c)** If  $n = 2^m + l$ , then  $\|f_n\|_{L^1(\lambda_{[0,1]})} = \int_{[0,1]} f_{2^m+l} d\lambda_{[0,1]} = 1/2^m$ . Since  $m \rightarrow \infty$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , taking limits we see that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|f_n\|_{L^1(\lambda_{[0,1]})} = 0$ . This shows that  $f_n \rightarrow 0$  in  $L^1(\lambda_{[0,1]})$  but from part (b),  $f_n$  **does not** converge to 0  $\mu$  a.e.

3. Consider the measure space  $([a, b], \mathcal{B}, \lambda)$ , where  $\mathcal{B}$  is the Borel  $\sigma$ -algebra on  $[a, b]$ , and  $\lambda$  is the restriction of the Lebesgue measure on  $[a, b]$ . Let  $f : [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be any continuous function. Show that the Riemann integral of  $f$  on  $[a, b]$  is equal to the Lebesgue integral of  $f$  on  $[a, b]$ , i.e.

$$(R) \int_a^b f(x) dx = \int_{[a,b]} f d\lambda.$$

**Proof** Since  $f$  is continuous, then  $f$  is Riemann integrable on  $[a, b]$ . For each  $n \geq 1$ , divide the interval  $[a, b]$  into  $2^n$  intervals of equal length  $I_0^{(n)}, I_1^{(n)}, \dots, I_{2^n-1}^{(n)}$ , where

$$I_j^{(n)} = \left[ a + \frac{j(b-a)}{2^n}, a + \frac{(j+1)(b-a)}{2^n} \right).$$

Let  $\mathcal{C}^{(n)} = \{I_j^{(n)} : 0 \leq j \leq 2^n - 1\}$ . Notice that  $\mathcal{C}^{(n+1)}$  is a refinement of  $\mathcal{C}^{(n)}$ , and  $\|\mathcal{C}^{(n)}\| = \frac{1}{2^n} \rightarrow 0$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . For each  $n$ , define the choice function  $\xi^{(n)}$  by  $\xi^{(n)}(I_j^{(n)}) = a + \frac{j(b-a)}{2^n}$ . Then,

$$\mathcal{R}(f; \mathcal{C}^{(n)}, \xi^{(n)}) = \sum_{j=0}^{2^n-1} f\left(a + \frac{j(b-a)}{2^n}\right) \cdot \frac{1}{2^n}.$$

By Riemann integrability of  $f$  we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{2^n-1} f\left(a + \frac{j(b-a)}{2^n}\right) \cdot \frac{1}{2^n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathcal{R}(f; \mathcal{C}^{(n)}, \xi^{(n)}) = (R) \int_a^b f(x) dx.$$

Now, let  $f_n = \sum_{j=0}^{2^n-1} f\left(a + \frac{j(b-a)}{2^n}\right) \cdot 1_{I_j^{(n)}}$ , then  $|f_n| \leq \|f\|_u$  for all  $n$ . By uniform continuity of  $f$ , given any  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $|f(x) - f(y)| < \epsilon$  whenever  $|x - y| < \delta$ ,  $x, y \in [a, b]$ . Moreover, there exists an integer  $N \geq 1$  such that  $\frac{1}{2^n} < \delta$  for all  $n \geq N$ . Thus, if  $n \geq N$ , then  $|f_n(x) - f(x)| < \epsilon$  for all  $x \in [a, b]$ . This implies that  $f_n \rightarrow f$  pointwise on  $[a, b]$ . Since  $f$  is bounded, then  $\int_{[a,b]} |f| d\lambda \leq \|f\|_u(b-a)$ , and hence  $f$  is  $\lambda$ -integrable. By the Lebesgue Dominated Convergence Theorem,

$$\int_{[a,b]} f d\lambda = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \int_{[a,b]} f_n d\lambda = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{2^n-1} f\left(a + \frac{j(b-a)}{2^n}\right) \cdot \frac{1}{2^n} = (R) \int_a^b f(x) dx.$$

4. Let  $(E, \mathcal{B}, \mu)$  be a measure space, and  $f_n : E \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  a sequence of measurable real valued functions on  $(E, \mathcal{B}, \mu)$ . Let  $f : E \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a measurable function such that  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \mu(|f - f_n| \geq \epsilon) < \infty$  for all  $\epsilon > 0$ . Show that  $f_n \rightarrow f$  in  $\mu$ -measure and  $\mu$  a.e.

**Proof.** Let  $\epsilon > 0$  be given. For any  $0 < \epsilon' < \epsilon$ , and any integer  $m \geq 1$ ,

$$\mu\left(\sup_{n \geq m} |f - f_n| \geq \epsilon\right) \leq \mu\left(\bigcup_{n=m}^{\infty} \{|f - f_n| \geq \epsilon'\}\right) \leq \sum_{n=m}^{\infty} \mu(|f - f_n| \geq \epsilon').$$

Since  $\lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{n=m}^{\infty} \mu(|f - f_n| \geq \epsilon') = 0$ , it follows that

$$\lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} \mu\left(\sup_{n \geq m} |f - f_n| \geq \epsilon\right) = 0.$$

By Theorem 3.3.7,  $f_n \rightarrow f$  in  $\mu$ -measure and  $\mu$  a.e.